Assessment of potential sites for Faecal Sludge Treatment Plant at Prayagraj

Background:

On 11th Jan 2020, CSE team visited five potential sites for establishing Faecal Sludge Treatment Plant for the treatment of faecal sludge generated from household dependent upon onsite sanitation systems in western Prayagraj including peri-urban areas.

The locations of the five sites is shown in the map below:



Based on scoring criteria for FSTP, ranking for suitability of the sites for FSTP is given below:

- 1. Site 1: Bhagwatpur (Score 87)
- 2. Site 2: Rawatpur (Score 71)
- 3. Site 4: STP Kalindipuram (**Score 59**; scoring would improve drastically if an NOC from ADA can be obtained)
- 4. Site 3: Kotwa (**Score 49**; good location wise but there are private plots adjacent to it; reports of dispute or private claim to the site)
- 5. Site 5: Near Lake (**Score 69**; seems to be scoring well as per the criteria since readily available and scope for re-use; Not recommended as site is highly undulated (a hill in the middle); a lake in 100 to 200m and more that 5 to 6 kms from the habitation area)

A comparative with detailed scoring of the five potential sites is shown below:

Criteria	Site 1:	Site 2: Rawatpur	Site 3: Kotwa	Site 4: STP	Site 5: Near Lake
O and in a file and	Bhagwatpur 2	C f: +:	Carthand	Kalindipuram	Court Lored O
Ownership of land	Govt. land - 8	Confirmation	Govt. land.	Ownership of	Govt. Land - 8
		needed 4	Under dispute	ADA. – 4;	
			from private parties - 4	availability for FSTP needs to be	
			parties - 4	confirmed	
Availability of land	Readily available	Confirmation	Confirmation	Confirmation	Readily available
Availability of fatiu	(based on initial	needed 3	needed - 3	from ADA – 3	(based on initial
	discussion; to be	needed 3	needed - 3	(area available	discussion; to be
	confirmed) - 10			0.5 acre)	confirmed) - 10
Distance from	500 – 1km - 7	3 – 5 km - 7	100 – 500m – 3	Within 100m – 0	Greater than 5
residential area /	300 - IKIII - 7	3-3 KIII - 7	(however,	Within 100m – 0	km - 3
habitation			private plotting		KIII - 3
Habitation			adjacent to site)		
Approach road	Wide road - 5	Wide road - 5	Wide road	Wide approach	Wide approach
, ipproudit roud		Wide road 2	through colony –	road – 5	road – 5
			2		
Visibility and impact	Good road;	Good road	Good road	Prominent	Unreachable to
, .	display board	(interior area) –	(interior area) –	location; public	common people
	improve visibility	5	5	transport – 15	– 2
	-10			·	
Reuse option for	Reuse possible	Reuse possible	Partial reuse	No chance	Reuse possible
treated effluent and	Effluent and	Effluent and	possible – 5	effluent reuse /	Effluent and
dried manure	manure – 15	manure – 15		or manure – 2	manure – 15
Disposal of treated	Gravity – 5	Gravity – 5	Gravity – 5	Partial pumping	Gravity – 5
effluent				-3	
Social acceptability. Is	No probability;	No probability;	Issues may arise;	No probability as	No probability;
there any chance of	no habitation –	no habitation –	but can be	existing STP and	no habitation –
problem for society?	10	10	addressed – 5	SPS – 10	10
Chances of flood in	No recent	No recent	No recent	No recent	Occasionally
the area	flooding - 7	flooding - 7	flooding - 7	flooding - 7	flooding – 5
Is there any water	500m – 1 km –	500m – 1 km –	500m – 1 km –	500m – 1 km –	100-200m – 4
body adjacent to the	10	10	10	10	
site					
Total Score	87	71	49	59	67

Details of the five potential sites for FSTP visited is given below:

Site 1: Near Bhagwatpur; 1.5 – 2 acres available,



Site	Advantages	Disadvantages
Near Bhagwatpur (Approx. 2 acre)	 Site is accessible from 2 sides Access from state highway Closest to airport New establishment coming up in the area Mostly flat with gentle slope No water body in vicinity 	 Few old trees needs to be cleared Some excavated / illegally mined area.

Site 2: Near Rawatpur (adjacent to United Medicity)



Site	Advantages	Disadvantages
Rawatpur near medicity (Approx. 3 acre)	 Barren land with flat gradient No water body in vicinity Agricultural land on the other side of the road Land accessible through wide road 	 High tension towers within the site. Adjacent to high profile commercial development

Site 3: Adjacent to Shambunath temple (Kotwa Village)









Site	Advantages	Disadvantages
Kotwa near Shambhunath temple (Approx. 4 acre)	 Close to airport. Flat land Approx. 0.5 acre of land excavated (illegal mining) and cleared from vegetation available. 	 Site has dense vegetation Site under dispute Private plotting adjacent to site. Small temple / shrine adjacent to site

Site 4: at the abandoned STP in Kalindipuram





Site	Advantages	Disadvantages
Defunct STP, Kalindipuram (Approx. 1.5-2 acre)	 Sludge drying beds of STP can be used in FSTP Very approachable and visible Existing infrastructure like boundary wall, admin room etc already available. 	 Sewer network is proposed in the area Functional SPS in the vicinity. Can be an alternate FS disposal point. Area available would be sufficient for FSTP. Showcasing green area through re-use may not be possible.

Site 5: Close to a Lake



Site	Advantages	Disadvantages
Near Kotwa (Approx. 2 acre)	 Agricultural land around the site. Govt. land and readily available. 	 Undulated site with steep slope on one side and low lying area on other Site is under dispute Farthest from non-sewered areas Water body nearby